INTERNATIONAL FEDERATION OF LIBRARY ASSOCIATIONS AND INSTITUTIONS
WORLD LIBRARY AND INFORMATION CONGRESS

82th IFLA GENERAL CONFERENCE AND ASSEMBLY
Columbus, Ohio, United States of America

13-19 AUGUST 2016

CATALOGUING SECTION

ISBD/Linked Data Study Group
http://www.ifla.org/en/node/1795

Meeting: Monday, August 15th 2016 (C226 Meeting Room 4) 14:00-16:00

Draft minutes[1]

Attendeees:

Members : MaríaVioleta Bertolini (Chair), Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi, Vincent Boulet, Gordon Dunsire, Dorothy McGarry, Mélanie Roche, Ricardo Santos, Françoise Leresche, Elena Escolano (Skype attendance)

Observers: Agnese Galeffi (Vatican School of Library Science), Richard Sapon-White (Oregon State University), John Hostage (Harvard University), Jay Weitz (OCLC), Irena Kavčič (National and University Library of Slovenia), Marja-Liisa Seppala (National Library of Finland), Cynthia Whitacre (OCLC), Jenny Wright (BDS), Patrick Le Boeuf (National Library of France), Regina Romano Reynolds (Library of Congress), Chris Oliver (University of Ottawa Library), Lynne Howarth (iSchool, University of Toronto), Iman Dagher (University of California, Los Angeles), Sandy Roe (Cataloging and Classification Quarterly)

1) Welcome and introductions

M. V. Bertolini welcomed the members and the observers.

2) Announcements (Other meetings relevant to the group after this meeting)

> **Monday, August 15th**
>> 16:00-17:00 ISBD RG (C226 Meeting Room 4)
>
> **Tuesday, August 16th**
>> 11:30-13:00 Cataloguing SCII (C226 Meeting Room 4)
>> 13:45-15:45 Open session: IFLA Standards - making a difference? - Committee on Standards (Hall E)
>> 14:00-15:30 PRESSoo RG (C226 Meeting Room 4)

---

[1]Note that these minutes do not necessarily reflect the chronological order in which each topic was discussed.

Wednesday, August 17th
    08.00-09.30 Standards Committee Business Meeting II
Thursday, August 18th
    11:15-12:45 LIDATEC (C223 Meeting Room)
    13:15-14:15 FRBR RG (C226 Meeting Room 4)
    14:30-16:00 ISBD RG (C226 Meeting Room 4)
Friday, August 19th
    09:00-17:00 FRBR Technical Meeting - Carnegie Board Room, Columbus
    Metropolitan Library, Main Library, 96 S. Grant Avenue

3) Approval of the agenda

The agenda was approved without change.

4) Approval of the Minutes of the ISBD/Linked Data SG Meeting held in Cape Town, August 2015[2]

The minutes were approved without change.

5) Debrief of ISBD Linked Data Study Group Working Meeting in Paris (May 30th-31st, 2016, Bibliothèque nationale de France) (Chaired by Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi)

The SG midterm meeting was held in Paris on May 30th-31st. Meeting face to face was essential to finalise the final draft of the *Guidelines for Use of ISBD as Linked Data*, especially for the revision and reformatting of examples. The SG also finalised the work on the ISBD-FRBR alignment: the elements that could not have been discussed during previous meetings were reviewed, and final decisions were made throughout the table.

At the end of this meeting, the two documents were considered ready to be sent out to the ISBD RG for comments.

6) Approval of the ISBD Linked Data Study Group Annual Reports 2014-2015[3] and 2015-2016[4].

The reports were adopted without change.

7) Matters arising from the Minutes of the Cape Town meeting, Paris meeting, and Action list 2015[5]:

7.1) Alignment between ISBD and RDA namespaces (Status update)

7.1.1) Alignment of the ISBD element set with RDA element set

G. Dunsire reminded the SG that if a revision of the alignment is needed (e.g. following the outcomes of the RSC's meeting in November), the issue should be considered as a whole and treated systematically, rather than as individual points

---

[2] http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/isbd-lg-minutes_2015.pdf

[3] http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/isbd-ld-activities_2014-2015.pdf

[4] http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/isbd-ld-activities_2015-2016-draft.pdf

[5] http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/isbd-lg-action-list_2015.pdf

being raised randomly. If needed, the topic can be allotted some specific time during the next WLIC.

Action 1: G. Dunsire will check the ISBD/RDA alignment and inform the SG if an update is needed following the October 2017 update of RDA.

7.1.2) Map of ISBD to RDA namespaces

G. Dunsire produced three RDF maps based on the alignment, along with an (unfinished) explanatory document. The maps are in turtle (ttl) but can be opened in Notepad or any text editor. Until IFLA has a space in GitHUb, the maps will be uploaded to the RDA Registry as part of ISBD/RSC protocol.

7.1.3) Mapping of ISBD area 0 vocabularies to RDA/ONIX Framework vocabularies

Action 2: G. Dunsire will distribute the ISBD content form compounds.

Action 3: the SG will send comment to G. Dunsire about the vocabulary.

7.2) Alignment between ISBD and FRBR namespaces (Status update)

7.2.1) Alignment of the ISBD element set with FRBR element set

The work on the alignment was finalized during the Paris meeting in May 2016, and most remaining issues were solved *via* email.

One remaining issue regarded parallel elements: R. Santos and E. Escolano expressed their concern that the alignment for "parallel title" ($<$) was inconsistent: since "title" was mapped as $=$, according to the rule about parallel elements, it appears that "parallel title" should also be mapped as $=$. F. Leresche explained that a "parallel title" is actually a "parallel title *proper*" in the ISBD, consequently it has the same mapping as "title proper", which is mapped as $<$ because FRBR does not have the concept of "title proper" (as is made clear by the definition). There is therefore no inconsistency with the general rule on parallel elements. The introduction needs an additional sentence documenting this decision.

G. Dunsire explained that the "URI" columns are misleading: they were kept because the mapping was modelled after the RDA alignment, but this is not a mapping between URIs but between elements. Still, the SG deemed the URI columns very useful, especially for reference purposes. A few lines may be added to the introduction in order to explain why we specify "unconstrained" elements in the description of the table columns.

The SG agreed that there is no need for a "Notes" column. However, an additional paragraph is needed in the introduction so as to document how and why the major decisions were taken. The drafting of this paragraph will be a collaborative work and should be completed by the end of the congress.

Action 4: G. Dunsire will draft the missing lines in the introduction explaining the use of "unconstrained" elements in the description of the table columns in the ISBD/FRBR alignment.

Action 5: M.V. Bertolini will initiate a Google document before the end of the WLIC so that the SG can work on documenting the major decisions in the introduction, (e.g. the decision regarding "parallel title").

7.2.2) Map of ISBD to FRBR namespaces

7.2.3) Further work and impact on the ISBD revision process & ISBD

The new FRBR-LRM model will be the foundation of the future revision of the ISBD. As soon as the model is published, the SG will need to revise the ISBD/FRBR alignment so as to keep it up to date with the model.

Although a lot of the work can and will be done remotely, it is of crucial importance that the SG can meet face-to-face during the year in order to fulfil this task. The SG will therefore submit a project proposal to the Professional Committee, detailing the scope, timeframe and expected budget of the new project.

G. Dunsire recommended that the SG should keep close contacts with the RSC so that a collaborative work can be carried out, although the actual form of that work has yet to be determined (online exchanges, small working group?).

Action 6: M. Gentili-Tedeschi will continue to keep close contacts with the FRBR Consolidated Editorial Group in order to identify future linked data issues

Action 7: M. Roche and M.V. Bertolini will complete a project submittal to be reviewed by the ISBD RG by the beginning of October

Action 8: the SG will submit the project plan to the ISBD RG.

7.3) Other alignments and mappings

7.4) ISBD Unconstrained namespaces (Status update)

7.5) Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data (Status update)

After the midterm meeting in Paris, M. Roche applied the IFLA template for Standards on the *Guidelines* and M. Gentili-Tedeschi submitted the document to the ISBD RG for validation. Once they are validated, the *Guidelines* will be submitted to the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee and the Committee on Standards for final approval. M. V. Bertolini sent the draft version to A. Galeffi for publication on the ISBD LD SG webpage.

7.6) ISBD Application Profile (Status update)

After WLIC 2015, M. V. Bertolini performed the first cross-check of the description set profile with the application profile technical analysis and submitted it for comments to M. Willer, G. Dunsire and M. Gentili-Tedeschi. Comments were received from the team, and M. Gentili-Tedeschi submitted a new version that included comments and questions.

The group set out to discuss this document, but too many inconsistencies were discovered: it

seemed unlikely that the xml file compiled by M. Willer was faulty. Before going further on with that work, the SG therefore needs to collect contextual elements regarding the history of the xml file from G. Dunsire and M. Willer.

Action 9: M. Roche will highlight all changes made to M. Gentili-Tedeschi's document and send it to G. Dunsire and M. Willer for review.

Action 10: G. Dunsire and M. Willer will review the xml application profile.

Action 11: G. Dunsire and M. Willer will produce a document explaining the history of the xml file and the choices made.

8) "Revision of ISBD, Area 2: Discussion paper" Draft, ver. 0.13, 21.4.2016 (Prepared by Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi, ISBD Review Group chair for the IFLA Cataloguing Section's Standing Committee) (Status update)

On Saturday, August 13th, M. Gentili-Tedeschi presented a position paper to the CATS SC, in which he laid out the issues raised by the revision of Area2. He also stated that the ISBD RG is willing and able to undertake the revision of the standard, and asked that they should be allowed to start as soon as possible. His paper elicited little reaction from the SC: a few questions were asked about the structure and future direction of the ISBD, and whether a more atomic approach to the elements was considered.

9) Liaisons (Status update)

9.1) Permanent UNIMARC Committee (Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi)

The PUC is considering aligning the LC codes for Medium of performance with the vocabulary maintained by the IAML, so that the community can benefit both from the multilingual translations of the IAML on the one hand, and from the definitions of the LC vocabulary on the other hand. As of now, it is still unclear whether the two vocabularies will be merged or aligned.

9.2) DCMI (Gordon Dunsire)

9.3) RDA/ONIX Framework WG (Gordon Dunsire)

Alan Danskin is the new chair of the study group. The framework is stable and therefore not very active at the moment, but its activity is likely to increase with the next developments of RDA.

Action 12: G. Dunsire will liaise with A. Danskin and inform the SG of any Linked Data Issue arising with the oncoming RDA/ONIX developments.

9.4) ISSN International Center (Clément Oury)

In C. Oury's absence, R. Reynolds reminds the SG that the ISBD is the basis for the ISSN manual and the description of ongoing resources. She therefore asks that the ISSN International Center be involved in the revision process as a stakeholder.

9.5) Other liaisons

10) Chair's report:

10.1) Project 2013: *ISBD Namespaces Alignments and Publication as Linked Data*

10.2) Project 2014: *Development of ISBD Namespaces Alignments and Usage*

11) Nominations and Election of the Chair for the next term (2016-2018)

M.V. Bertolini's two-year term as chair of the SG is coming to an end. M.V. Bertolini wishes to pass her chairwomanship on to somebody else, while remaining a member of the SG and seconding the incoming chair in their duties for a transition period of one year, in the same way F. Leresche seconded her when she came into her chairwomanship. She asked if someone would like to nominate themselves.

Mélanie Roche nominated herself and was elected as incoming chair.

Action 13: M. V. Bertolini will announce the new chair to the CATS second SC on Wednesday, 17th.

12) Status of projects and issues arising

13) Other business

Respectfully submitted,

Maria Violeta Bertolini, ISBD Linked Data Study Group chair
Mélanie Roche ISBD Linked Data Study Group incoming chair